



A Note on the Seventh Day Baptist Relationship to the Church of God

By Craig M White

V. 4.5 2016, 2025



“He who has an ear, let him hear what the spirit says to the churches” (Rev 3:13)



A Note on the Seventh-Day Baptist Relationship to the Church of God

Authored by Craig Martin White.

Copyright © Craig Martin White, GPO Box 864, Sydney, Australia 2001.

All Rights Reserved.

This work is promoted through History Research Foundation (USA), History Research Projects (Australia) and Friends of the Sabbath (Australia)
www.friendsofsabbath.org

No part of this work may be edited. It may be freely shared as part of research, projects or for educational purposes as long as quotes are properly cited.

All graphics are taken from the internet where they were made freely available.

Articles in this series:

- *A Note on the Christian Israelite Church and the Sabbath*
- *A Note on the Name 'Church of God (Adventist)'*
- *A Note on the Seventh Day Baptist Relationship to the Church of God*
- *Church of God & Sabbatarian Timelines (since the late 1700s)*
- *Church of God History. Tending to the Past. Preserving for the Future*
- *Church of God Timelines*
- *Do Church Eras Exist?*
- *Doctrines of the Sabbatarians since the First Century*
- *Historical Sabbatarian and Church of God Fundamentals of Belief*
- *History of the Advisory Council of Elders*
- *History of the Fair Chance Doctrine*
- *History of the Feast of Tabernacles in the Radio/Worldwide Church of God*
- *History of the Place of Safety Doctrine in the Church of God*
- *History of the Plain Truth magazine*
- *History of the World Tomorrow Broadcast*
- *History of Worldwide Church of God Foreign Works*
- *History of Worldwide Church of God Ministerial Conferences*
- *History of Worldwide Church of God Publications*
- *How the Israel Identity truth entered the Church of God*
- *Notes on the Third Resurrection Doctrine in the Church of God*
- *Passover and Holy Day Observances since the First Century*
- *Sabbatarian Groups. A Scattered and Little Flock*
- *Seventh Day Baptist Relationship to the Church of God*
- *The Doctrinal Heritage of the Church of God in the Nineteenth Century*
- *The Identity of the German Peoples in Church of God Doctrine*
- *The Independent Sabbatarian Groups c1800-1860. Compilation of Research Notes*

Contents

Abstract.....	5
Background Comments	5
The Clarence Orohrelle Dodd (1899-1955) article and other information	9
Origin of the Seventh Day Baptists	11
The William T Voyce Letters	14
Dr Hoeh's changed understanding	18
William Miller and the revival of the Church of God grouping.....	22
Seven Churches are Seven Distinct Restorations of the Work	25
Final Remarks	30
Appendix One. "Research Reveals Plain Truth"	32
Appendix Two. "The Plain Truth Responds"	35
Appendix Three. Seventh Day Baptist Interactions with the Church of God.....	36
Appendix Three. Chart of Several Possible Relationships to Church Eras	37
Associated Reading	38
References.....	38

History Research Projects

GPO Box 864, Sydney, Australia 2001

www.originofnations.org

www.friendsofsabbath.org

No limitation is placed upon reproduction of this document except that it must be reproduced in its entirety without modification or deletions. The publisher's name and address, copyright notice and this message must be included. It may be freely distributed but must be distributed without charge to the recipient.

The purpose and desire is to foster Biblical, historical and related studies that strengthen the Church of God's message & mission and provides further support to its traditional doctrinal positions.

Abstract

The term *Church of God* is used in the Bible and by various Church of God groups as a title for God's people and name for their particular group. As this is the English translation of Greek or Hebrew, other similar translations may be used such as Congregation or Assembly or Community of God's or Yhwh's people and such like. Although the term *Church of God* is a correct title for God's people, there is little proof that they actually used that title throughout their history. They may have, but proof is very limited. Instead, they were likely known by other names and titles. This article shows that even in the nineteenth century such was the case. Further, links between the Seventh Day Sabbatarians/Baptists and what we know to be the Church of God has been minimal.

Background Comments

We should all understand and accept that the Churches of God and the Seventh-Day Baptists (SDBs), though loosely linked and related, are rather distinct. Our history is intertwined, yet separate. We have similar sabbatarian roots, but operate parallel to each other.

Many years ago (around 1979) I read a book on *Seventh Day Baptists: their legacy to Adventists* by Russell J Thomsen which helped to clarify my understanding on the small relationship that has existed between the two bodies and some of the details were expanded upon.

In addition, several papers are available on the interactions between the Seventh Day Baptists with the Seventh-day Adventists and also with the Church of God (seventh day) in the late 1800s and early 1900s.

The most important part of this relationship points to a Seventh Day Baptist woman bringing the Sabbath truth to Sunday Adventists whom then adopted the Sabbath day as a core doctrine. At this time there is no proof that independent Seventh Day Baptist groups merged with these new Sabbath-observing groups to form the Church of God. Rather, only a few individuals from the Seventh Day Baptists crossed over.

My research on all of this culminated in the article *The Independent Sabbatarian Groups c1800-1860* which was simply a collection of all available information I could find. Here is an extract informing the reader of my thinking:

"Over the centuries, the true believers may not have officially called themselves 'Church of God' but would have gone under a similar title or another descriptive title.

...

In the collection of information in *The Independent Sabbatarian Groups (non-SDB) c1800-c1860*, I brought together whatever sources that could be sought to find out more about the offshoots from – or those Sabbatarian groups that didn't join the

first Sabbatarian General Conference in 1801. At that time only 8 churches joined the General Conference with the majority remaining independent. Full organisation came about in 1806. Information on these early conferences and how some congregations did not join with it is available in *Seventh Day Baptist Conference. It's Origin*.

Twelve years later, in 1818,¹ the General Conference voted to change the term Sabbatarian to Seventh Day Baptist. Some congregations remained outside of the General Conference and do not know if there are any records of them in State libraries in America or held by the Seventh-day Baptists themselves.

Did they become or merge with the Church of God groups that sprung up? Did they die out? Or did they become part of the Seventh Day Baptist Conference?

We can speculate that these remnant Sabbatarian groups, in existence alongside the Seventh Day Baptists continued on and found their way among the Sunday Adventists per the below. Or, we might understand that the Seventh-day Baptists are the continuing chain of groups since the 1600s with a new set of groups emerging in the mid-1800s giving rise to the Church of God (seventh day) and various other groups such as the Worldwide Church of God.

When Baptist preacher William Miller proclaimed the imminent return of Christ commencing about 1831, many began to respond (he was a Sunday keeper and never became a Sabbatarian). Whilst his followers were popularly known as 'Millerites' among themselves they were known as 'Adventists' – proclaimers of Christ's second coming – His literal second coming."

Concerning the influential Christian Connexion group mentioned above (also known as Christian Connection and Christian Church) – it is of interest that some of them converted to the seventh day Sabbath in 1820 (Bert Haloviak in *Some Great Connexions: Our Seventh-day Adventist Heritage*, page 15) What became of this group is unknown: did they join the Seventh Day Baptists, stay independent or die out?

In this article I pursue further thought on the links, or lack thereof, between the Seventh Day Baptists and the emerging Church of God of the mid-nineteenth century. For instance, John Kiesz in his *History of the Church of God (Seventh day)*:

"It is evident that there were Sabbath-keeping groups (independent) besides the Seventh Day Baptists, before and during the time of William Miller's preaching and prediction of the end of the world, in 1844. Elder Gilbert Cranmer of Michigan wrote in his memoirs that he received his first light on the Sabbath in 1843 from an article in the *Midnight Cry*, a Millerite publication, written by J. C. Day of Ashburhan, Massachusetts. S. C. Hancock of Forestville, Connecticut, also advocated the doctrine in the same year ... Many isolated groups had sprung up in various areas, it is said, before the 1844 disappointment, that is, seventh-day local groups, as well as isolated individuals. This may be readily ascertained from things that were written by Elder James White (and by others) about their various trips they made to groups which they tried to get into their fellowship. When the Whites made their tours over the Eastern and Midwestern states in the early 1860's for the purpose of effecting cooperation and general organization, they found many

¹ Refer to Kenneth Strand's *The Sabbath in Scripture and History*, p. 246.

congregations of Sabbath-keepers. Many of them became affiliated with the Seventh-day Adventists, while others began to fellowship and cooperate with those who later became known as the "Church of God." Some of the groups remained independent of all general organizations. Subsequent church history shows that although some of the independent Sabbatarian groups aligned themselves neither with the Seventh Day Baptists, nor with the Seventh-day Adventists, yet for logical reasons, as far as they were concerned, did actually desire cooperation and fellowship in order to more effectively propagate gospel truths as they saw them." (p. 2)

We need to understand that here is, at this time, no proof that Seventh Day Baptist ministers and congregations joined with Sunday Adventists to eventually morph into the Church of God. However, although some few individual Seventh Day Baptist members and at least one of their elders joined this new grouping, they didn't become it.

However, we should note the following:

"The issue of the seventh-day Sabbath was brought up by a few Millerite Adventists, most notably by the Scot, James A. Begg, [a SDB from Edinburgh] who urged Adventists in America to study the topic in 1841 ... By June 1844, the primary periodical published by the Seventh Day Baptists, the *Sabbath Recorder*, noted "that considerable numbers of those who are looking for the speedy appearance of Christ have embraced the seventh day, and commenced observing it as the Sabbath." They suggested that keeping the seventh-day Sabbath was "the best preparation" for the Second Coming" ...

"... the initial point of contact for Sabbatarian Adventism came through a Seventh Day Baptist woman, Rachel Oaks Preston. **Although individuals like Beggs had brought up the topic, she was the influential, yet inadvertent, catalyst that helped start a movement.** Although the connection between Wheeler and Preble is unclear, it appears generally accepted by historians of both traditions that this was the birth of the Sabbatarian Adventist revival.

"Bates and Sabbatarian Adventism quickly absorbed and transformed the Seventh Day Baptist understanding of the seventh-day Sabbath. This can be seen in Joseph Bates's tract, *The Seventh Day Sabbath, a Perpetual Sign*, originally published in August 1846. He argued that truth is progressive, and that the Sabbath (which he obtained from Preble) was new light." ("Developments in the Relationship between Seventh Day Baptists and Seventh-day Adventists," *Andrews University Seminary Studies* by Michael Campbell, p. 197, 199) [emphasis mine]

This is also raised in the article "Seventh Day Baptist Influence Upon Millerites," *Religion and Tolerance*, Issue 6, 2006, pp. 111-20, by Radmilo Bodioga:

"James A. Begg became known to Millerite Adventists by writing a letter in The Signs of the Times of April 1, 1841. In that letter Begg tried to explain his belief in the seventh-day Sabbath. It was the first direct reference to the seventh-day Sabbath in Millerite Adventist literature...

In April 1842, B. Clark, who was a Seventh Day Baptist minister, tried to influence other Adventists regarding the Sabbath through the columns of the Signs of the Times." (pp. 113-14)

So, others also brought up the subject prior to Rachel Preston Oakes.²

In 1843 the SDB General Conference resolved that it was their duty to enlighten the Millerites/Sunday Adventists to the Sabbath and again in 1844:

“it is our solemn duty to connect with all our efforts to enlighten them in reference to the Sabbath prayer to God for his blessing.” [emphasis mine]

On page 2 of volume 1, number 1 of their periodical *Sabbath Recorder* note the article “The Second Advent and the Sabbath.” It states:

“We learn from several sections that considerable numbers of those who are looking for the speedy appearance of Christ, have embraced the seventh day, and commenced observing it as the Sabbath.”³

So, they were certainly aware of the Adventist movement and its potential. It is important to realise that a Seventh Day Baptist woman, Rachel Oakes in late 1843 or early 1844 challenged a Sunday Adventist Minister (a Methodist Episcopal minister and associate of William Miller, but aligned with the Christian Brethren grouping) on the question of the Sabbath. After becoming convicted of observance of the seventh day in March 1844, he began to reach out to and meet with other Adventists on this day. (Regarding Rachel Oakes: Harris was her maiden name; Oakes was her first married name; and her second marriage was to a Preston. (*Historical Dictionary of the Seventh-day Adventists*, pp. 237-38)

That was the first recorded sabbatarian meeting(s) by Adventists. The above occurred in Washington, New Hampshire.

A few months later, the SDB publication, the *Sabbath Recorder* published an article that claimed that large numbers of Adventists were now Sabbath-observers (“The Second Advent and the Sabbath,” *Sabbath Recorder*, 13 June 1844, p. 2, by George Utter).

It should be noted that SDBs (and possibly independent Sabbatarians that emerged from the SDBs in or around 1818) were extant alongside the emerging sabbatarian Adventists. and the latter did not morph from the SDBs.

I hope that this article will help to clarify thinking and debate on this intriguing historical matter.

Finally, here in Australia my own interactions with the Seventh Day Baptists has been with their American office, various members across Australia, visits, attendance at seminars and in particular how some of them observe the Biblical Holy Days. How they came to a knowledge of that is a separate story.

² She is also discussed in Merlin Burt, *Rachel Oakes & the Verona Seventh Day Baptist Church* (1 Oct 1995), a document this author came across in the Seventh Day Baptist Historical Library and Archives, 1 Nov 2024.

³ “The second distinctive doctrine added by this group of Adventists to Miller's belief in the Second Advent was sanctity of the seventh-day Sabbath. This belief, which had been gradually spreading among many of the Millerites even prior to October 1844, was derived from several sources, but the Seventh Day Baptists, some of whom were Millerites, exerted a steady influence on the Second Adventist believers to keep the seventh day holy.” (N. Gordon Thomas, “The Millerite Movement in Ohio,” *Ohio History Journal*, vol 81, Spring 1972, no. 2, p. 106)

Further reading:

Don A. Sanford, *A Choosing People. The History of Seventh Day Baptists.*

Don A. Sanford, *A Free People in Search of a Free Land.*

Don A. Sanford, *Greater Than Its Parts.*

The Clarence Orohrelle Dodd (1899-1955) article and other information

Before we explore the Church of God and SDB relationship, it should be noted that Herbert W Armstrong would have been aware of them, but most of his interactions were with the Church of God (Seventh Day). Some of those interactions were not always positive and it would behoove us to have a quick look at the situation below prior to commencing the Church of God – SDB connections.

Herman Hoeh's sermon referred to above mentioned that there were those among the Church of God in the late 1920s and early 1930s who listened attentively and understood what God was saying to them through His spirit (presumably to proclaim Israel Identity and the Holy Days) and those that didn't (ie rejected the adoption and proclamation of these doctrines).

As a result, God used Herbert Armstrong for the purpose in proclaiming these truths in a major way – others who could have been used and were available did not proclaim these truths to the world with any major impact.

“He who has an ear, let him hear what the Spirit says to the churches.” (Rev 3:13)

So one part of the Church of God that developed gradually since the 1840s listened and another part did not. Some of those that did not pursued Armstrong as he explained below in an article “... And now, Again – A New Good News”, *Good News*, February 1963, page 8:

“In searching old files for information for this article, I ran across an article by C. O. Dodd, co-founder of the Salem, West Virginia, movement of 1933, which split that church. This article was written in 1938, after Mr. Dodd had fallen out with Mr. Dugger's movement.

It is captioned “My Apology.” In part, Mr. Dodd wrote:

“I wish to make this apology to the members and ministers of the Salem and Stanberry and German branches of the Church of God, for certain misrepresentations in the organization work of 1933 ... I went along with the leaders and continued to be used in these deceptions ... Later, when I saw **mistrust, envy and strife** grow rampant in the ranks, I knew that God was not blessing a work founded on rank **misrepresentation** ... I, therefore, in the spring of 1937, resigned from the Salem organization, but have continued to work with God's people in the three branches even until now ... First, let me say that at the time of reorganization” (the split in 1933) “I thought that the plan was to get the church on

a higher plane, to have the members live holier lives, to have an organization free from partyisms and politics, to study and grow in advancing light ...

About a year afterwards, however, I concluded that we had been deceived, as I saw **favoritism and respect of persons shown in the ruling clique**, saw old time politics played as aforetime, members allowed to live as before, and ministers forbidden to teach new truths, and told that, 'We have a saving message. What we have is enough.' I thought God could overrule this, and so remained silent until this time; but now I wish to apologize and ask for pardon."

I was one of the men to whom Mr. Dodd referred, forbidden to teach new truths. Of course I continued very vigorously to preach these new truths. That led to final and complete severance of cooperation between the Sardis and Philadelphia eras of God's Church.

For years I had tried working *with* ministers of this Sardis church. But they only worked *against* the true Work of God. They plotted to kill the broadcast.

They resorted to lies-which they well knew to be deliberate lies-to discredit me personally."

In other articles on the situation Herbert Armstrong explains:

"From the very first, in my association with these Sardis brethren, I was treated by their ministers as a greenhorn tail-ender. The Sardis brethren all loved me. But their **jealous** ministers used every device constantly to humiliate me and persecute. God blessed my efforts to produce 'fruit,' but their efforts produced none!" ("History of the Beginning and Growth of the Worldwide Church of God," *The Good News*, May 1980).

Notice what Armstrong wrote about these attitudes in another Church amongst a few of the people he encountered there. Some of the ministry were jealous of him, antagonistic and had a competitive spirit (*Autobiography of Herbert W Armstrong*, Vol 1, p. 474, 1973 edition).

Some of these jealous ministers were looking for all kinds of excuses for having a go at him that they then picked on his wife according to the *Good News*, June/July 1980 (a series titled "The History and the Beginning and Growth of the Worldwide Church of God") page 24:

"But in all boldness I said that if one of these men dared say a word against my wife, I would forget I was a minister, and close their mouths with my fists! ... and the brethren would have backed me in shutting their mouths from accusing my wife".

It's a pity that some tried to provoke one to that extent, but what else is new? Mr Armstrong later wrote

"... opposition from other ministers, both within this church and without, was met at every turn continually" (p.; 319 of the *Autobiography*).

In that aforementioned series he also wrote:

"Persecution from their [jealous] ministers continued" (September 1980, *Good News*, p. 28).

Now this quote is excellent:

"Always the brethren ... had been more than friendly to me – they really did love me and my wife. It was their **jealous** ministers, who were fruitless in the work, who persecuted me" (August 1980, *Good News*, p. 4).

You can read about Armstrong's experiences in the last few chapters of the *Autobiography*. It was merciless how they tried to turn the membership against him.

Those that were harassing him were not listening to what the Spirit was saying to the Churches – so they attacked the messenger out of jealousy –one whom was listening to the Spirit and doing something about it!

Yet he persisted and undertook major studies that laid the foundation for phenomenal growth in doctrinal knowledge of the Church of God (Daniel 12:4). Like a sifter, he carefully read many core works and absorbed the necessary truths into his doctrinal knowledge. This formed the basic architecture for the Philadelphia era's doctrinal positions. But its roots go deeper, as we are about to see.

Origin of the Seventh Day Baptists

We do not know precisely when the SDBs began to form as a loose denomination, but it seems to some time after the Reformation and appeared in Germany, Holland and then England. However, they were simply known as *Sabbatarians* or similar at that time.

In England, they were Sunday-observing Anglicans who saw from the Scriptures that the seventh day was indeed the Sabbath. These advocates for seventh-day Sabbath observance included John Trask, Theophilus Branbourne, Thomas Tillam and James Ockford.

Meetings were held privately and in secret due to persecution but eventually, around 1617, the first English congregations appeared. It is thought that John Trask founded the Mill Yard church with his wife. He was later imprisoned for his religious convictions. Later, in 1676, the Pinner's Hall congregation was founded by Francis Bampfield.

By 1700 eleven congregations are documented to have been extant in addition to scattered families and individuals who were convicted of the Sabbath.

Due to the persecution, Stephen Mumford of the Tewkesbury congregation, decided to migrate to Newport, Rhode Island (because of its guarantee of freedom of worship) in 1664 and in 1671 founded the first known Sabbatarian congregation in America at Newport, with seven members which grew to 40 by 1692.

Over a short period other assemblies began to emerge such as that in Hopkinton, Rhode Island which grew to over 1,000 members by the late 1700s.

Later, Abel Noble showed Baptists the light of the Sabbath in the area of Philadelphia and by 1703-05, a new Church was formed in Piscataway, New Jersey, formed by Edmund Dunham. Henceforth the Sabbatarians spread slowly to other parts of America and eventually into other countries.

By 1740 the first known Sabbatarian school was founded in America at Ephrata, Lancaster county, Pennsylvania by Ludwig Hacker who was a German Seventh Day Baptist (this group was formed in 1728 after separating from the German Baptists). A good summary of the German Seventh Day Baptists is found in Randolph's booklet *The Sabbath and Seventh Day Baptists*, pages 22-26).

By 1801-02 eight congregations decided to form a General Conference (holding only advisory powers and missionary work) with full organisation completed by 1806 although governance remained in the hands of the local congregations (it was not incorporated until 1927). The Conference voted in 1818 to adopt the name Seventh Day Baptists in lieu of Sabbatarian Baptists although many congregations did not go along with the name change (preferring *Sabbatarian Baptists*). Records show that only 1,130 people claimed SDB membership in America 1801.

Prior to that time, the name *Seventh Day Baptist* was not recognised officially and the sabbatarian groups were known under various other titles. Dr Hoeh notes:

“God's people were commonly referred to as Sabbatarians in the 17th and 18th centuries and that is how we identified them – rather than by the now common denominational term Seventh Day Baptist.” (article appears in Appendix Two)⁴

The SDB Missionary Society was formed in 1828 in an attempt to spread the Sabbath message and stimulate growth and the group gradually spread into other continents.

There were later interactions between the Church of God and the SDBs as we shall note later in this article.

Charles Monroe wrote noted the following in the Church of God publication *Facts of Our Faith*:

⁴ “It is evident that there were Sabbath-keeping groups (independent) besides the Seventh Day Baptists, before and during the time of William Miller's preaching and prediction of the end of the world, in 1844. Elder Gilbert Cranmer of Michigan wrote in his memoirs that he received his first light on the Sabbath in 1843 from an article in the *Midnight Cry*, a Millerite publication, written by J. C. Day of Ashburhan, Massachusetts. S. C. Hancock of Forestville, Connecticut, also advocated the doctrine in the same year ... Many isolated groups had sprung up in various areas, it is said, before the 1844 disappointment, that is, seventh-day local groups, as well as isolated individuals. This may be readily ascertained from things that were written by Elder James White (and by others) about their various trips they made to groups which they tried to get into their fellowship. When the Whites made their tours over the Eastern and Midwestern states in the early 1860's for the purpose of effecting cooperation and general organization, they found many congregations of Sabbath-keepers. Many of them became affiliated with the Seventh-day Adventists, while others began to fellowship and cooperate with those who later became known as the "Church of God." Some of the groups remained independent of all general organizations. Subsequent church history shows that although some of the independent Sabbatarian groups aligned themselves neither with the Seventh Day Baptists, nor with the Seventh-day Adventists, yet for logical reasons, as far as they were concerned, did actually desire cooperation and fellowship in order to more effectively propagate gospel truths as they saw them.” (John Kiesz in his *History of the Church of God History (Seventh day)*, p. 2) Further details about the period 1840-1880 may be found in *The Journey. A History of the Church of God (Seventh Day)* by Robert Coulter.

"It should be mentioned here that the Seventh Day Baptist denomination and the Churches of God were never one and the same organisation. It was from the Seventh Day Baptists of New England, that the great Advent movement was faced with the Sabbath truth. Apart from the Sabbatarian Baptists and Adventists, there have been a host of saints of similar faith in the old world, there hidden by God in the valley hideouts and the back country, this being decades before the birth of Sabbatarian Baptists in England.

We make no attempt however to prove an "organisational" link with these faithful down through the ages; we realize that this is not necessary as long as our people of our day embrace that same sustaining faith set forth in the Scriptures. The Churches of God continue to identify themselves with that "original" Church of God, purchased by the blood of Christ, Her Head, when He died at Calvary in Jerusalem." (p. 14) [emphasis mine]

The above points raised by Monroe should be noted for any serious student of Sabbatarian and Church of God history. Researcher Leon Lyell comments

"It's true that it took a long-time for 'seventh-day baptist' to become an official name - but most sabbatarians were 'baptist' (originally a pejorative term) and preferred a congregational model - i.e. they resisted being organised (which was an issue for HWA to deal with). **They often referred to themselves descriptively as 'sabbatarian baptist' or 'seventh-day baptist' but also simply as the 'church of God' or 'church of Christ' as was [also] common amongst Church of England clergy. They didn't have our sense of corporate identity!**

In seventeenth century England with the rise of literacy and the availability of printed Bibles many Englishmen began to read the Word of God for themselves. As the result many long-forgotten prophecies, history and teachings were re-discovered. Amongst these was the seventh-day sabbath. The topic was widely discussed from the King to the Parliament to the common man. Many, from a variety of what we would today call 'denominations', accepted the seventh-day Sabbath. In time this enthusiasm for the truth seems to have passed in England but from the flowers that bloomed there the seeds travelled to North America on the winds of persecution. The first known sabbatarian baptist church in America was founded in 1671 at Newport Rhode Island with the support of English sabbatarians." (E-mail from researcher Leon Lyell to Craig White dated 3 June 2008) [emphasis mine]

Many fine books have been published on the history of the SDBs and I list several below should the reader wish to delve into the subject further. It is not the aim of this article to do so. Among the recommended reads are:

- "An Historical Perspective. "The Separation"," *New Beginnings* by J Franks
- *Conscience Taken Captive. A Short History of Seventh Day Baptists* by D Sanford
- *The English connection: the Puritan roots of Seventh-Day Adventist belief* by B Ball
- *Sabbath and Sectarianism in Seventeenth-Century England* by D Katz
- *Sabbath History 1. Before the Beginning of Modern Denominations* by AJ Bond
- *Seventh Day Baptists in Europe and America*, vol. 1 by AN Rogers
- *Seventh-Day Baptists – Their Legacy to Adventists* by J Thomsen
- *The Doctrines of the Seventh-day Men* by Leon Lyell

- *The Seventh-day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800* by B Ball
- *The Seventh-day Sabbath Sought Out and Celebrated* by Thomas Tillam. Originally published in 1657. He was put in prison for his faith and wrote the book as a response to a pamphlet *The Abrogation of the Jewish Sabbath or the Sabbath of the 7th Day of the Week* by William Aspinwall. Tillam's book even identified Sunday observance as the Mark of the Beast.

The William T Voyce Letters

It has been many years since I learned of the Voyce letter but only ever saw a small extract or two. So I am grateful to Alex Peshevski who was able to obtain copies of these and provided them to me in 2015. Alex spent some time hunting down these letters and was able to obtain them from William Voyce's wife who gave the go-ahead to make them available. I extend my gratitude to Alex for his efforts.

Out of interest, William Voyce was not a Church of God member but a Seventh Day Baptist. Apparently he was a serious theologian, who put a lot of effort into his history studies and research of the Seventh Day Baptists and simply wanted to check the facts and present this to the Worldwide Church of God.

Below are some key extracts from them. The entire collection is available online at <http://www.friendsofsabbath.org/ABC/Church%20of%20God%20History/SDBs%20&%20CoGs-William%20T%20Voyce%20etc/>

1. Letter from the Seventh Day Baptist Historical Society 5 June 1968 to William T. Voyce explains that the term Church of God is used only once in relation to the Seventh Day Baptists and that was pertaining to the Church in Piscataway which was organised in 1705.

“The church of God keeping the commandment of God and the faith of Jesus Christ, living in Piscataway and Hopewell ...”

However, the original records have it as The Church of Christ. Later the Shrewsbury Church was also known as “The Church of Christ in Shrewsbury and Middletown ...” (this was recorded in 1774).

Similarly the Bell Lane Church was called The Church of Christ in documents dating to 1668 and 1680.

2. Ellen G. White publications 10 June 1968 explained to Voyce how James White used the term Church of God.

James White in the *Review and Herald* and some others in their contributions used the term “ ‘church of God,’ in its very general sense ...” rather than as a corporate title or label.

3. In a letter dated 13 June 1968 the Seventh Day Baptist Historical Society corrected certain misinterpretations in Dugger's book, for example the group that Dugger thought was part of Church of God heritage was actually a Baptist Church. The letter included a copy of a critique of Dugger's

book in the *Sabbath Recorder* dated 28 December 1942.

4. The Seventh Day Baptist Historical Society letter to Voyce dated 15 October 1968 reveals:

“... if you look more deeply into the subject you will find that these early Michigan “churches of Christ” were former followers of William Miller.”

These Churches of Christ must not be confused with the lineal descendants of the Seventh Day Baptists under whichever name (SDB) they were generally known as well as The Church of Christ.

5. In a letter to Voyce dated 3 December 1968 the Seventh Day Baptist Historical Society explains that Dugger on pages 265-87 thinks he is quoting from *A History of the Sabbatarians, or Seventh Day Baptists, in America* by Clarke (1811) but the quote is actually from *A History of Seventh Day Baptists in West Virginia, including The WoodbridgeTown and Salemville Churches in Pennsylvania and the Shrewsbury Church in New Jersey* by Colin Randolph (1905).

6. In a further letter to Voyce, the Seventh Day Baptist Historical Society (7 February 1969) provided historical proof that the Sabbatarian Baptists in West Virginia to whom Dugger refers used the terms Seventh Day Baptist and Seventh Day Baptist Church of Christ. In that Church’s records it states that:

“March 20th, 1853 ... From examination of the scripture we have decided according to the best of our understanding that on the fourteenth day of the first Jewish month is the day in which the death and suffering of Christ should be commemorated. Therefore we decline communing according to our previous appointments, and commune once in twelve months.”

... The minutes of the 1843 session of our General Conference record the following resolution that was passed at that session:

“Resolved, That in view of the necessity of the influence of the Holy Spirit to incline men to the love of the truth, **it is our solemn duty to connect with all our efforts to enlighten them in reference to the Sabbath, earnest prayer to God for his blessing.**”⁵ [emphasis mine]

The letter goes on to explain what is common knowledge – a Mrs Rachel Preston in the Spring of 1844 brought the truth of the Sabbath to Millerite/Sunday Adventist Churches.

⁵ “The Seventh-day Baptist Central Association,” *The Sabbath Recorder*, 16 June 1859 noted:

“That members (and we know not how many), have left us in consequences of their having adopted sentiments in connection with Adventism, not common to the Seventh-day Baptist Churches, we admit” (p. 2)

Under the heading “Communications” we have this statement:

“The senior of the editorial Committee is reported to have once said: “The defence of the Sabbath of Jehovah and its advocacy in these last days of the apostacy, is rolled upon us as a people, **and if we are unfaithful to the cause, God will raise up some other people to who he will give that high and holy work.**” Or words to that effect. **If these are prophetic words, they are surely fulfilling;** for the despised Sabbath-keeping Adventists [this including Church of God people in those days] have made seven thousand converts to the Sabbath in a little less than ten years ...

“Put what we are doing in contrast. Our people profess to have existed two hundred years, and scarcely number seven thousand now ...

“Why this contrast? Oh, we have become a very respectable people. We are conducting ourselves very respectably, and this Adventism, soul-sleeping until Christ comes, and then having paradise – new heavens and new earth – on this old geologically rotten, crazy, volcanic, fire-bellied world, is such strange, unpopular doctrine, we shall lose this respectability we have acquired in society if we admit it among us.” (p. 2) [emphasis mine] Given their rejection of these truths, it seems God could not use them to undertake a large work.

"I repeat – I have seen in no original book of our early churches, nor in any early correspondence – the term Church of God in connection with their official name. I have seen frequently – Church of Christ."

7. Letter from the Seventh Day Baptist Historical Society to Voyce 17 April 1969:

Extracts from historical sources (*The Seventh Day Baptist Memorial*, vol 2, p. 121 and *The Seventh Day Baptist Memorial*, vol 2, p. 160) were enclosed with the letter and ended with the statement:

"A great many of our S.D.B. churches have in their official name – the phrase – The Seventh Day Baptist Church of Christ."

8. Voyce in turn wrote to the Worldwide Church of God 3 June 1985 alerting it to these historical errors. It should be noted that these are minor and this feedback helps us to 'tweak' the history of Sabbatarians. I am unsure whether his letter was ever responded to.

Voyce takes umbrage with the following part of Herbert Armstrong's 1981 article:

"A few remain faithful

By 1800, Protestant doctrines were prevalent in the Sabbath-keeping congregations. Many began to form a denomination. This group officially adopted the name "Seventh-day Baptist" in 1818.

Ten or 12 congregations - in the Pennsylvania to Rhode Island area alone - would not at first affiliate with this denomination of men. Even as late as 1828, only 16 to 20 congregations were being represented at the Seventh-day Baptist Conference meetings, **while they spoke disparagingly of other "fanatical and unworthy" Sabbath keepers** (*The Seventh-day Baptists in Europe and America*. pp. 153, 175).

As always, the *few* had refused to go along, and had remained faithful to the name and doctrine of the Church of God! In the middle of the century these remnants of God's people are found in fellowship with Sabbath-keeping people who were part of a great Advent movement." ("The Church they couldn't destroy," *Good News*, December 1981, p. 10) [emphasis mine]

Here is what Voyce wrote:

"... In 1802, of course, the Sabbatarian General Conference was formed; in 1818 the name was changed to "Seventh Day Baptist" General Conference. Now the Dugger-Dodd thesis assumes that not all the Sabbath-keeping congregations became Seventh Day Baptists; that those who did not eventually united (temporarily) with the Sabbath-keeping Adventists sometime during the period 1844-1860, and then continued on as the Church of God when the majority chose the name "Seventh-day Adventist." If this did in fact occur we should naturally expect some sort of proof; we must not simply assume that it happened simply because our theology teaches that it should have.

In your article you quote the phrase "certain fanatical and unworthy observers of

the Seventh-day" as if it did in fact refer to Sabbath-keepers of this type--that is, people who continued to hold to the truth in spite of ridicule, persecution, etc., from the General Conference. Let us therefore investigate this quotation and the circumstances surrounding it to see if we can discover what group of Sabbath-keepers it is really referring to.

The quote itself is, of course, taken from p. 175 of the book Seventh Day Baptists in Europe and America, Vol. 1, as you acknowledge. As such it is part of a summary of the proceedings of the 1826 General Conference sessions. The paragraph in which this phrase appears reads as follows:

"A letter from the Rev. Mr. Burnside, who had died in April, acknowledges the receipt of an interesting Magazine; but requests that nothing except letters be sent him, **on account of the "enormous expense;" describes certain fanatical and unworthy observers of the Seventh-day**; mentions a book on "The Christian Sabbath," by the Rev. G. Holden, A.M.; gives an account of the kind reception of his own book; and tells of his efforts to spread Sabbath truth." [emphasis mine]

It would be nice, wouldn't it, if only we had a copy of the full text of Mr. Burnside's letter, so we could learn exactly who these "fanatical and unworthy" Sabbath-keepers were. Well, I just happen to have such a copy, as reproduced in the minutes of the 1826 General Conference sessions. Here is how that letter begins:

"Palmer's Rents, Snowsfields Borough,
London, January 16th, 1826.

"The Rev. Robert Burnside, Pastor of the Seventh-day Particular Baptist Church, London, to the Rev. Eli S. Bailey, Corresponding Secretary to the Seventh-day Baptist General Conference, sendeth Christian salutations:"

The letter then goes on to describe the "fanatical and unworthy" Sabbath-keepers:

"Some years ago there lived in London, an infamous female impostor, of the name of Joanna Southcott. The woman, though dead, seems to have left numerous followers behind her, who are dispersed in bodies through various parts of England. A small body of them has been settled about five years, eight miles west of Manchester. They not only keep the Seventh-day, (how I know not) but wear beards of extraordinary length, and circumcise their children. They call themselves, "True Israelites" One of the children happening to die soon after circumcision, occasioned a trial at Lancaster last summer and it is thought to have given rise to the fabrication in question. Nothing, however, transpired at the trial in any wise answering to the description of the Sabbatans: the leader of these people, whose name I do not know, is variously represented; one account declares him to be a profligate of the most cruel kind, the other says nothing bad of him. It is stated, that the great support of these people, is the Head of a Factory, who attempted to walk upon the water, in imitation of our Saviour; but showed his wisdom on the occasion in nothing, except in choosing the summer for making the experiment

....⁶

Interestingly enough, I have had contact with an associated portion of these people for decades and even wrote a short article about them titled *A Note on the Christian Israelite Church and the Sabbath* which expounds a little on this matter.

What does this teach us? Simply this: we must make changes to specific details in our understanding of whatever is shown to be in error, no matter how minor.

The Voyce letters demonstrate that the Church of God today has some, but limited linkage to the Seventh Day Baptists which did not morph into the Church of God in the mid-1800s but remained as separate, distinct groups apart from those Advent churches that arose at that time. There is no evidence of a transfer of the baton, so to speak, from the Seventh Day Baptists (or any of their offshoots, if such existed) into the groups that became the Church of God (seventh day). There could have been such a baton transfer, but we are still looking for the historical evidence.⁷

Finally, we should not be too harsh on Dugger and Dodd, after all they did they best they knew and here is one quote from their book which shows just that:

"In later records of the early Sabbatarians, who later became known as Seventh Day Baptists, we find them using the name the church of Christ, and the church of Jesus Christ. See *Seventh Day Baptist Memorial*, Vol. 2, p. 27.

Often the names, the Church of God, and the Church of Christ, were used interchangeably. -- Randolph, *History of Seventh Day Baptists*, pp. 11, 12.

In later records we find the name, Sabbatarian Church of Christ, and Seventh Day Baptist Church of Christ. Later the words "of Christ" were dropped, and these people became known as Seventh Day Baptists. -- Idem, p. 36, Vol. 2 No. 1.

After the church at Newport had faithfully held the true light aloft for one hundred and forty-five years, in obtaining a charter the year 1819, their name was registered as "The Seventh Day Baptist Church of Christ." (A *History of the True Church*, chapter 22)

Overall, the Dugger and Dodd book is very good, with some details that should be corrected.

Dr Hoeh's changed understanding

In his booklet *A True History of the True Church* (1959) which drew upon Dugger and Dodd's book on the *History of the True Church* and other sources such as *Truth Triumphant. The Church in the Wilderness* and the book *Facts of Faith* etc (all available for free on the internet), Herman Hoeh

⁶ Andrew Ferguson Dugger, 19th century Church of God pioneer, condemned Southcott in his book *Points of Difference between the Church of God and the Seventh-day Adventists Briefly Stated*.

⁷ It is outside the scope of this article to delve into the interactions between the Church of God and the SDBs c1860s – 1920s when there was some (but very little) cross-over between their members and the Church of God. Or the mooted merger between the two groups, that never eventuated.

wrote the following:

"From England the true Church of God spread to America. In 1664, Stephen Mumford, sent to Newport, Rhode Island, raised up a small church mainly from Baptist converts. One by one new churches were established through continued help of the churches in England.

But as always happens, after several generations the children take truth for granted and never really surrender their wills and their lives to God. In less than one hundred and fifty years, the English churches almost disappeared, having cut themselves off from God BY TURNING FROM His truth, and by adopting the name "Seventh-day Baptists."

In America the NUMBER OF CHURCHES gradually increased as the gospel was spread from state to state. But so nearly dead were these congregations that in 1802 MANY began to ORGANIZE THEMSELVES together into a General Conference instead of submitting to the government of God for the carrying out of the gospel. At this serious juncture, MOST of the local churches JOINED THEMSELVES TOGETHER to form the Seventh-day Baptist General Conference and thereby ceased to be the true Church of God. Soon they began teaching the pagan Trinity doctrine and the immortality of human souls!⁸

Several faithful congregations did not become members of the Conference because they would not submit to the new Protestant doctrines being introduced (see p. 246 of Belcher's "Religious Denominations"). For another half century the congregations maintained the little truth they possessed, although most of them did not go all the way in obedience to God. John aptly described this period: "Be watchful, and establish the things remaining, WHICH ARE ABOUT TO DIE, for I have not found thy works perfected before my God" (Rev. 3:2).

The Adventist Movement

During this time the advent movement among SUNDAY-OBSERVING CHURCHES was begun by the uninspired William Miller. In 1843 several followers of Miller in Washington, New Hampshire, became acquainted with the truth of the Sabbath. **It was not until after the miserable disappointment of 1844, however, that the general body of Adventists had the Sabbath question called to their attention. A small number accepted the Sabbath and SOON UNITED WITH THE FEW REMAINING CHURCH OF GOD BRETHREN who refused to be affiliated with the Seventh-day Baptist Conference.**

They called themselves the "Church of God" and began publishing "The Advent Review and Sabbath Herald". Their first songbook was dedicated to "The Church of God scattered abroad."

With each passing year, new and different doctrines were being introduced by Ellen G. White to explain away the Adventist failure of October 22, 1844. The original Church of God brethren generally did not go along, with the "inspired testimony" of Ellen G. White. Finally, a meeting was held by some of the members in Battle Creek, Michigan, September 28 through October 1, 1860." (pp. 23-24) [emphasis mine]

No proof was offered for the above portion I highlighted in bold so I did my own investigation while

⁸ Concerning the trinity, the SDB 1833 General Conference produced an *Expose of Sentiments* (doctrinal beliefs statement) which included a statement on the trinity. "We believe that there is one God. We believe that Jesus Christ is the Son of God, and that the Holy Spirit is the Spirit of God, and of Jesus Christ his Son. We believe that there is a *union* existing between the *Father*, the *Son*, and the *Holy Spirit*; and that they are equally divine and equally entitled to our adoration." It should be noted that because they observe an open creed, these doctrines were not binding on congregations or members. See <https://www.one-eternal-day.com/2008/02/seventh-day-baptist-history-iii.html>

still at school and continued to pursue this matter. Many years later I assembled what I could find and produced a collection of quotes in *The Independent Sabbatarian Groups c1800-1860* referred to previously.

Some few Seventh Day Baptists did join the fledgling Adventist movement, but there is no evidence for their ministers or entire congregations doing so.

In 1981 in an article "Can You Explain It?" published in the *Good News* magazine August 1981 Herman Hoeh wrote:

"It should not come as a surprise that Seventh-day Adventists, as a group, know what the Bible says. They do observe the Sabbath. And more than 120 years ago they had fellowship with the people of God, whom we know later in history as the Church of God (Seventh Day). It was with the Oregon Conference of these Church of God people in the late 1920s and early 1930s that Herbert W. and Lorna D. Armstrong had fellowship, and out of which the Worldwide Church of God has grown.

Unlike Seventh-day Adventists, the Worldwide Church of God knows and believes the prophecies of the Bible — and teaches them (Rev. 3:8, 10). Why, then, do knowledgeable Seventh-day Adventists not believe what they know the Scriptures say?

One very dear friend and an elder in the Seventh-day Adventist Church explained it this way to me more than 15 years ago, "If what you teach comes to pass, I will believe it!" Why do Seventh-day Adventists not believe it now?

To find the answer to this question, we must turn time back 150 years.

The great Adventist movement

The year was 1831. Excitement was in the air, both in Britain and the United States. It was generated by expectations of the Second Coming of Christ and an ensuing 1,000 years of peace.

This excitement was related, for the most part, to the preaching of ministers who had come to believe the proclamation then being made, beginning 1831, by a prosperous New York farmer, William Miller. That year, it should be observed, was 18 centuries, exactly, after the founding of the New Testament Church of God in A.D. 31.

William Miller thought the Kingdom of God would come and the 1,000 years of peace — the Millennium — would begin not later than 1844. He was wrong about the date (based on a misunderstanding of Daniel 8). But his proclamation about the establishment of the Kingdom of God and a thousand years of peace among nations was true. Tens of thousands came to believe William Miller's proclamation. The world called them Millerites or Adventists (the word Advent was used in English in that day, whereas we today use Coming to express the thought of the Second Advent or Second Coming of Christ). **But the people who believed William Miller called themselves the "people of God," the "Israel of God" and the "Church of Christ" and the "Church of God." They were a scattered people, not formally organized.**

These "people of God" believed in the establishment of the Kingdom of God on earth for 1,000 years. However dimly perceived, they knew what the Bible says about a Millennium of peace on earth among nations. Thus the Advent Movement, as it was called, believed what the Worldwide Church of God today announces, and not what Seventh-day Adventists teach about Satan and his demons residing on earth for 1,000 years while the saints reign in heaven.

But 1844 was a great disappointment for many. Christ did not come. William Miller

had been wrong in his understanding of the times. And he admitted it. But there were those who did not want to admit it. It hurt their spiritual pride. Instead of acknowledging that the time for the close of this age and the Second Coming of Jesus had not yet arrived because the Gospel of the Kingdom of God had yet to be announced to the world as a whole — radio and television, air travel and satellite communication had not yet been invented to make that final announcement possible — and instead of giving up the error of 1844 completely, there were individuals whose minds dwelt on the date. They let slip the proclamation — the good news — of the 1,000 years of peace on earth among nations.” [emphasis mine]

Notice that Hoeh accepted that the people we term Church of God today normally used other titles or names for themselves. Over the centuries these were the spirit-led, Law-abiding people of God whichever era they may have found themselves in.

Later, in 1991, the *Plain Truth* published a series on the history of the Church of God, but it contained certain minor errors which were picked up by the Seventh Day Baptist official historian, Don Sanford. He took exception to a few items in the series and wrote a short article about this in “Research Reveals Plain Truth,” *The Sabbath Sentinel*, March 1992 (article is reprinted in Appendix One). For instance he mentioned that:

“Under a section headed, “The Name of the Church,” the authors correctly recognize the Hopkinton congregation (the First Hopkinton Seventh Day Baptist Church in Ashaway, RI) as an outgrowth of the Newport Church, **but refer to it as the “Church of God,” based on a couple of passages which use the term “church of God” in a generic sense.**

They correctly date the founding of the church at Piscataway, NJ, from the study of the Scriptures by Edmond Dunham in 1705. **The authors call it “the Church of God,” but a check of the record books clearly show that the early minutes all begin with the phrase, “The Church of Christ keeping the commandments of God and the faith of Jesus Christ ... ” Several early Seventh Day Baptist churches did use the name Church of Christ,** possibly to clearly identify the church as Christian rather than Jewish because of their Sabbath observance.” [emphasis mine]

Dr Herman L Hoeh on behalf of the Worldwide Church of God responded (article appears in Appendix Two):

“As you know, God's people were commonly referred to as Sabbatarians in the 17th and 18th centuries and that is how we identified them-rather than by the now common denominational term Seventh Day Baptist.

...

As author Don A. Sanford says of the literature of God's people, **the church of God was used as a generic term, not a denominational term.** We used it thus throughout our series, and do not dispute the use of other terms in the Sabbatarian churches, for the New Testament does the same.” [emphasis mine]

So, from the above we learn that Hoeh apparently acknowledges that the Seventh Day Baptist/Church of Christ groups, though part of the Body of believers for several hundred years, did

not somehow morph into the Church of God in the mid-nineteenth century.⁹

The Seventh Day Baptists continued with their protest and raised the issue at their 180th General Conference in 1992. Their historian, Don Sanford

“... expressed his concerns that the Worldwide Church of God tends to appropriate Seventh Day Baptist history as its own, arguing that if SDB’s don’t claim ad communicate their own history, others may claim it as theirs.” (“SDBs Meet For 180th General Conference, *The Sabbath Sentinel*, Oct 1992, p. 7)

William Miller and the revival of the Church of God grouping

Below is an extract from a letter I received from Clayton Steep, Worldwide Church of God letter answering department, dated 14 January 1983 answering several questions. One of them concerned my ongoing interest of mine extending 10 years previous (1973) on the ‘missing link’ in Church of God history.

“Re the <<missing link>> (1820-50), Dr. Hoeh said that the <<only indication is in the Seventh Day Baptist Memorial; actually the Church of God 7th Day was a new work under William Miller that began in 1831, as Mr. Armstrong began in 1931 after ordination.”

This confirmed my research that the ‘missing link’ needed further research. Over time I accumulated what I could in the articles *The Independent Sabbatarian Groups c1800-c1860*; *A Note on the Seventh Day Baptist Relationship to the Church of God*; and *The Doctrinal Heritage of the Church of God in the Nineteenth Century*.

Having tried to find the ‘missing link’ between the Sabbatarian Baptists from the early 1800s and the developing or reviving Churches of God in the mid-1800s, all that could be found were several Seventh Day Baptist breakaway groups that disappeared by the 1820s and there is no evidence that they continued and became the Church of God in the mid-1800s. There were, however, some Seventh Day Baptists members which joined the Millerite movement and one Seventh Day Baptist minister Samuel Davison who joined the Church of God, but that was in the 1860s. Most importantly it was the Seventh Day Baptist, Rachel Oakes, who brought the Sabbath to some Millerites in 1844 and were convicted of her witness.

In early 1990 I heard a sermon by Dr Herman L Hoeh on *A Time For* on aspects of Church of God history including his ‘take’ on how the Church of God developed (or revived) in the mid-1800s due to the preaching of the protestant, William Miller. The date for the sermon was 27 January 1990 and a week or so after hearing it I went to obtain a copy from the local church library, but it had either been wiped or returned to the national office. I had written some sermon notes but needed to have another listen to capture additional information. I put it on my ‘watch list’ and after almost 31 ½ years someone let me know that they had a copy and provided it to me 26 June 2021.

⁹ There have, however, been contacts and attempts at cooperation since the mid-1800s. This is outlined in Appendix Three

You can listen to the sermon [here](#) and especially from the 52nd minute to 59th minute.

He talks about the Sabbatarians in America and that they became known as Seventh Day Baptists. In the 1500s and 1600s it was a time to announce the Sabbath to a world that has largely forgotten it. But in 1831 it was the time to announce the second advent of Christ – that He was going to come back to judge the world. Dr Hoeh was of the opinion that God used William Miller (a non-Sabbatarian) to announce the second advent beginning in 1831. The people of God (usually called Churches of Christ prior to that, he thinks),

“were essentially no longer doing the Work of God. And God had to call somebody who had no immediate background with those people, who was William Miller. And He called many out of the denominations that were extent then ... it was 18 centuries since the crucifixion – so it was time to announce the second advent and then it was time for those people to learn about the Sabbath which they did in 1846. And then there was a time to examine whether there were visions of God or visions not of God ... and it was a time for those that were the majority to stay with the visions and a time, the minority, to leave and that minority became to be the background to the Church of God (seventh day)”.

He then talks about Herbert W Amstrong and that the lively branch of the Philadelphia Era was to proclaim the Gospel by having an open door to it and those branches which were not lively the door to do so was basically shut. He goes on to mention that he had heard the *World Tomorrow* program on the air in 1944 and had read a Coworker Letter of Mr Armstrong’s in 1946.

The Church of God, he said, did not listen to what the spirit said to the churches and Mr Armstrong did. But both groupings were the Philadelphia Era – one fruitful and the other not he believes. Presumably, this was due to the lively branch doing all it could to walk through the open doors; observe the feast days; and proclaim the Israel identity message.

However, while it is unlikely that a Sunday-observing trinitarian (who also believed in the immortal soul) could have launched the Philadelphia Era – rather it was his preaching about the return of Christ that certainly raised awareness of His coming as no one else was preaching it at that time (Miller was aware of the Sabbath and never observed).

From Miller’s preaching arose the Second Advent Movement – he proclaimed the second coming of Christ at a time when most preachers and Christians were either post-millennialists or a-millennialists. From that time on the pre-millennial return of Christ took hold and grew in popularity and understanding.

It seems to me that what happened is similar to what many Church of God folk have experienced: they read a religious book or books which opens their eyes a bit to the truth almost as an introduction to it. A little later they ‘discover’ a Church of God magazine but are already ‘primed’ to accept or delve into its teachings. Similarly, many listened to religious radio broadcasts or watched TV shows – then later they came across our programs and were convicted of the truth. God works in mysterious ways it seems!

Similarly, we use the works of Ethelbert Bullinger, Andrew Jukes, BIWF, various scholars as we grow in grace and knowledge – sifting through their materials: absorbing those points that add to our body of knowledge and eschew error. This happened over a long period of time – in the nineteenth

century there were non-Sabbatarians that were beginning to understand (at least in part) the truth about Israel, a fair chance for all, born again culminating in the resurrection etc. At that time Church of God people read these materials and absorbed some of their teachings (some were actually initially part of those groups such as Christian Connexion, Russellites etc). Perhaps the Philadelphian seeds were sewn in the nineteenth century, but Mr Armstrong was very blessed with understanding and took these truths to new heights and clarity of understanding (eg born again, feast days etc). God chose him to undertake the Philadelphia Era and to greatly expand on these doctrines and was revealed even more

In another audio sermon Herman Hoeh states that the Seventh Day Baptists were the Sardis era and the Church of God were part of a whole new era or work that Mr Armstrong came in contact with and because he listened to what the spirit was saying to the church of that time, was used by God to develop a powerful Work.

Concerning the sabbatarian Churches of Christ, I have the articles of faith of the Church of Christ (1774) listed in the publication *Historic Sabbatarian and Church of God Fundamentals of Belief*.

In relation to the above I stated the following in the article *The Doctrinal Heritage of the Church of God in the Nineteenth Century*:

“Of special interest to us is that the Church of God grouping that arose in the latter half of the nineteenth century, taught anti-Trinitarianism and the mortality of man – while the Seventh Day Baptists (in the main) from the early 1800s began to teach that God was a trinity (though not accepted by the majority and formalised until 1833) and that man possessed an immortal soul (Rev 3:2, 4). Thus, while this latter body of Sabbatarians lost vital truths, another group of Sabbatarians arose to proclaim truths that were being lost.”¹⁰

Further information is contained under the sub-heading “Christian Connection and the Sabbath”.

All of my articles on the history of the Church of God may be found [here](#).

Given the above, someone with an old Worldwide Church of God background probably has 2 options to consider in understanding the ‘missing link’:

1. that unknown congregations of Sabbatarian Baptists somehow found their way into the re-emerging Churches of God in the 1850s-80s, continuing the Sardis Era until Mr Armstrong came on the scene founding the Philadelphia Era; or
2. that God raised up a whole new phase of the Work becoming the Philadelphia Era in the mid-1800s, due to the preaching of William Miller. Later in the 1920s-30s some of that era listened to what the spirit was saying to the Church and some didn’t. Those that did were the ‘lively branch’ of

¹⁰ Henry Clarke, author of *A History of the Sabbatarians in America* wrote: “I conclude they [SDBs] all believe in one God, the Father and Maker of all things, sin excepted, and in one Lord Jesus Christ, or that Jesus Christ is the Son of God, and also in the Holy Ghost, as the operative power or spirit of God. But there are few if any, of this denomination, as I conceive, who believe that the Father, Son, and Holy Ghost, are three absolute distinct persons, coequal, coessential, and coeternal Gods, and yet but one God ; as such an idea would be in the face of scripture, and repugnant to right reason.” (p. 62) But by the 1830s the trinity doctrine had taken hold and most SDBs were believers in it.

“The Church of Laodicea would not be ... a split from the Philadelphia Church ... Zech 13:7 ... this verse can also refer to a leader in the Church of Laodicea ... **Remember individuals and local congregations may at any time be like any of these seven Churches. They all existed locally in the apostolic age!** ... if you are found in the Church of Laodicea, you probably don’t know it” (Leroy Neff in “*What is the Laodicean Church?*,” *Good News*, August 1959, page 10) [emphasis mine]

As Herbert W Armstrong wrote in *Mystery of the Ages*:

“The history of the Church would fall into **seven distinct eras--each with its own strengths and weaknesses** and its own special trials and problems.” (chapter 6) [emphasis mine]

No matter what era one thinks this or that person or this or that Church of God is, they are our brethren and not to be shunned and mistreated:

“This Church was drifting into a Laodicean condition. **Incidentally, both the Sardis and the Laodicean eras of the Church were God’s churches - NOT SATAN’S!** Someone spread the false rumour that I have said these others were or will be Satan’s churches ...” (Herbert W Armstrong in “What God never did – Never will allow to happen,” *Good News*, August 1979) [emphasis mine]

Mr Armstrong also wrote over time that the two or three last eras parallel each other. So, people with God’s spirit on a journey to eternal life – can operate parallel to one another.

But can there be more than two eras that exist side-by-side?

In this context it is of considerable interest that Christ said to the last four eras that he is coming to them:

Thyatira	“hold fast till I come”
Sardis	“I will come on thee as a thief”
Philadelphia	“Behold, I come quickly”
Laodicea	“Behold, I stand at the door and knock”

These statements are not made of the first three eras as they have now died out. But the last four, each with various communities it seems, alongside each other in the Last Days. While some similar statements are made to Ephesus (verse 5b) and Pergamos (verse 16), these are warnings of Christ’s punishment, not His return.

Out of interest, Appendix Four contains a chart of Several Possible Relationships to Church Eras for the reader’s further research and comment.

Many years ago I wrote an article on the *Seven Eras of Ancient Israel – Type of the Eras of the Church?* which attempts to align the seven churches to seven possible eras in ancient Israel. The first I had ever seen anything on this was in Bullinger’s *Companion Bible* in February 1977 whilst living in

England (I still vividly remember reading that!). This information can be found in the notes section adjacent to Revelation chapter 2, p. 1885.

My ideas on this developed over time and I found out years later that another member or two had similar – but not the exact same – views. So there is room for debate and exchange of ideas on these sorts of matters.

In a sermon by Herman Hoeh (27 January 1990) he inferred that a totally new Work arose due to Miller's preaching which was separate to the Seventh Day Baptists. It may have been in that sermon where he mentioned something about how the seven separate lampstands of Revelation 2 & 3 are rather different to the single lamp representing Old Testament Israel.

NB: candles were not used in ancient Israel or in the New Testament period – some versions use that term. Instead, lampstand (which is a stand for oil lamps) is the correct translation. This led me to write *Seven Restorations of the Work of the Church of God* years later attempting to explain the difference between the Old Testament lampstand representing Israel and the New Testament lampstands representing the Church in its seven distinct eras. Here is an extract from that article (slightly edited):

“Here is the difference and an important one at that:

The lampstand in the Old Testament is a **single structure with seven branches** – this signifies unity, a clearly identified group, continuum through similar structures.



Israel represented by the single lampstand

But ...

An evaluation of Revelation 2 and 3 indicates that **there were seven separate lampstands**, which indicates churches which history has not given much notice to and which characteristics are quite different. This indicates that the Church of God has operated in a sequence of seven epochs or phases since its dawn and with different governance structures. In other words they are not necessarily closely linked and seems to have a rather separate history. For it is God's Spirit that links them, not organizational means. For they are linked spiritually, based on foundational doctrines, the Law and His spirit.

Small and weak; persecuted and hated; pursued through hill and dale; mountain and valley, the Church of God fled for cover from Satan's agents – yet it survived. In contrast, Israel is more readily identifiable in history and in its institutions. While undergoing seven phases, Israel was noticeable as a political entity of sorts.

Yet Christ is in the midst of the seven lampstands, guiding them through His spirit and angelic agents.

What might one make of all of this?

Simply this: the Church of God has been going on a long, arduous journey of character creation, which in the main, has meant struggle for survival. The flames of the seven lampstands have flickered from bright to almost nothing, and in many cases, the flame went out.

Yet, from time-to-time, the lampstand which represents a particular phase as we have seen, burst brightly and spread the True Gospel message as best as it could.

As such, this aspect of the seven lampstands represent seven restorations or resurrections of the Work of the Church of God. The Church has continued through all centuries since its inception about 30/31 AD but only occasionally has it powerfully preached the Gospel to society. Most attempts have not been very successful.

Unfortunately, it is lamentable that those that reject the 'seven church eras' doctrine are missing out on some very important Biblical truths and principles. They also miss out on the wonderful truth that ancient Israel experience seven eras which parallel that of the New Testament spiritual Israel, thus throwing light on these seven churches, furthering our Bible understanding (refer to the article *The Seven Eras of Ancient Israel – Type of the Eras of the True Church?*)."



Seven individual lampstands representing the Church – which Christ walks among (Rev 2:1)

Later, in the same article I wrote (slightly edited):

"Let us now turn our attention to the first murmurings of the birth of the Philadelphia Era.

During periods in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, America experience evangelical fervour, known as the 'Great Awakening'. The influence of these movements may have given impetus to the eventual awakening and revival of a slumbering and virtually dead Church of God, regardless what they may have called themselves. God indeed works in mysterious and circuitous ways.

For when Baptist preacher William Miller proclaimed the imminent return of Christ commencing about 1831, many began to respond (he was a Sunday keeper and never became a Sabbatarian). Whilst his followers were popularly known as 'Millerites,' among themselves they were known as 'Adventists' – proclaimers of Christ's second coming – His literal second coming.

The second coming of Christ literally to the earth, a 1,000 year reign of His upon the earth and other truths were seldom mentioned or believed in Christianity – until the Advent movement. Indeed, Christianity was indifferent to Christ's return or was seeking it to occur after the millennium!

It took some years before a handful of the Adventists adopted the seventh-day Sabbath. This is how God, in His mysterious ways did this:

“Rachel (Harris) Oakes Preston (1809-1868), had a great influence on the Sabbatarian movement. She was a Seventh Day Baptist who persuaded a group of Adventists to accept the Sabbath and thus to become in that sense, the first Seventh-day Adventists. Born in Vernon, Vermont, she joined the Methodist Church, then joined the Seventh Day Baptist church of Verona, Oneida County, New York. Later she moved to Washington, New Hampshire, to be near her daughter, Delight Oakes, who taught school there. When Mrs. Oakes sought to introduce the Sabbath to the company of Adventists in the Christian church there, she found them so engrossed in preparation for the coming of the Lord that they paid little attention to her Seventh Day Baptist literature.

She did eventually gain as a convert, Frederick Wheeler, a Methodist preacher. One Sunday while conducting the communion service for the Christian congregation, he remarked that all who confess communion with Christ in such a service as this "should be ready to obey God and keep His commandments in all things." Later Mrs. Oakes told him that she had almost risen in the service to tell him that he had better push back the communion table and put the communion cloth back over it until he was willing to keep all the commandments of God, including the fourth. Knowing she was a Seventh Day Baptist, Wheeler thus began serious thinking and earnest study, and not long after about March, 1844, as he later related, he began to observe the seventh-day Sabbath. After the Great Disappointment in October, 1844, during a Sunday service in the Washington church, William Farnsworth stated publicly that he was convinced that the seventh day of the week was the Sabbath and that he had decided to keep it. He was immediately followed by his brother Cyrus and several others. And Mrs. Oakes, in turn, soon embraced the Adventist teachings. Thus it was that the first little Sabbatarian Adventist group came into being.

Mrs. Oakes later married Nathan T. Preston and moved away. Not until the last year of her life did she join what had meanwhile become the SDA Church.” (Adapted from the *Seventh-day Adventist Encyclopedia*, Volume 10, p. 1149, 1976. Review and Herald Publishing Association.)

And this is one of the lessons of the seven lampstands: unlike the political and organisational unity symbolized by the Old Testament lampstand, the New Testament has seven separate lampstands, symbolizing little connection between Church eras. Christ walks among the lampstands which demonstrates how separate they are (Rev 2:1).

This is an example of such – the Seventh Day Baptists continue the same era as that which sprang from the Anglicans in the 1500s and 1600s. Yet their connection or dialogue with the following era has been very small, although potent per the work of Mrs Oakes. Similarly, their connection with the previous era, was also not great from what we can make out.

Five groups emerged directly from the original Adventist/Millerite movement: Seventh-day Adventists (1863), Church of God (1866), and three Sunday-observing Adventist groups: Church of God of the Abrahamic Faith (1888), Advent Christian Church (1860) and the Life and Advent Union (1862) (the latter two merged in 1964). Except for the Sabbath, the Sunday observing Adventists groups have some major similarities to the sabbatarian Churches of God, including the future Kingdom of God on earth, conditionalism (soul sleep), anti-trinitarianism and water baptism.

Both Adventists and Churches of God are familiar with their common roots and beginnings during the nineteenth century. With the formation of the Seventh-day Adventist Church, some individuals and fellowships either never joined and remained outside of the SDA Church; withdrew in 1863; or later withdrew in 1866 (see Linden, *1844 and the Shut Door Problem*, pages 80-81; Bjorling, *The Churches of God, Seventh Day. A Bibliography*, pp. 10-14). Of course the Seventh-day Baptists remained a separate entity with direct continuum from the Sabbatarian Baptists.

Later, with the incorporation of the scattered non-SDA and non-SDB churches, the new group eventually became known as the General Conference of the Church of God. Later, in 1923, the name General Conference of the Church of God (Seventh Day) was officially adopted and has remained such to this day.”

It is from this particular Church of God that Herbert Armstrong joined and then later left to form the Radio Church of God which was renamed the Worldwide Church of God in 1968 – what we have come to know to be the Philadelphia Era of God’s people – just one of seven eras God raises up to undertake a Work during a certain period in history (refer to Appendix Four).

All eras are God’s people.

Final Remarks

The links between the Churches of God and other groups in the nineteenth century; what I term “the missing link” c1820-1850; how some were known as Church of God (Unattached) in the early twentieth century; the doctrinal development of the Church and the influences of the Christian Connexion etc have been of a particular interest to myself since my teens. Hopefully further information will become available over time to fill in the gaps of our knowledge on this subject.

From all of this the following questions arise:

1. should we take on board criticism and make the necessary minor adjustments to the history of the Church and other matters?¹¹

¹¹ The Seventh Day Baptists are willing to make corrections to their history (note the “Correcting Mistakes” series by Oscar Burdick listed in the *References* section.)

2. have many or most offshoots from the Worldwide Church of God since 1986 morphed into the Laodicean Era? Or are many of them simply the 'branches' of the old Philadelphia Era, some which may be fruitless?
3. do Church eras morph into each other or transfer the baton one to the other? Or is there very little linkage between them?
4. if there is very little linkage between them and there is no evidence of ongoing sequence of laying hands upon subsequent leadership or elders from one era to the next, how does one know it is legitimate? Or does God Himself place His name or blessing on a given leader of a Church which is evidenced by fruits? Does He anoint him and the new era and gradually reveal truths to it and provide a special mission to it (eg the Ezekiel Message for the sixth era) in addition to the Gospel message?
5. given the above, how has or will the Laodicean era emerge?
6. finally, as has been pointed out to me: could the term "hast not denied my name" (Rev 3:8) in reference to the Philadelphia Church mean that this church era has revived the true title of the church in these last days as the *Church of God*? For that title was possibly not used much over previous centuries. God's name also means His character, values and beliefs – all that He represents and stands for (cf Ps 91:14)

The miraculous raising up of the Chinese sabbatarians that Herman Hoeh wrote about in the *Good News* (Nov-Dec 1990) demonstrates that a direct lineal linkage between Church of God groups or eras morphing into the next era is not essential.

Finally, will the above launch a tweaking in our writings and understanding of Church of God history?

Appendix One

“Research Reveals Plain Truth”

by Don A. Sanford, historian

***The Sabbath Sentinel*, March 1992, pages 8-10**

Editor's note: Seventh Day Baptist historian Don A. Sanford has, on several occasions, shared with me his concern that a number of Sabbathkeeping groups claim Seventh Day Baptist history as their own-without identifying SDBs as such. Last year, *The Plain Truth* ran a series of articles entitled "History of the Church of God," which prompted the following article in the December, 1991, issue of *The Sabbath Recorder*, the official Seventh Day Baptist periodical. Your editor sent this article, along with a request for comment to Dr. Herman L Hoeh, editor of *The Plain Truth*. Dr. Hoeh's reply follows the article.

The Worldwide Church of God is running a series of articles in their *Plain Truth* magazine under the heading, "History of the Church of God." The Historical Society has received several letters questioning their use of Seventh Day Baptist history in establishing an unbroken claim to New Testament origins.

Seventh Day Baptists do not believe that the validity of the Sabbath is dependent upon any "apostolic succession" of an organized church. Attempts to prove such dependence on human institutions sometimes detract from the divine origin of the Sabbath.

Seventh Day Baptists believe that it is far more important to base the belief and practice of Sabbath observance upon the study of Scriptures rather than a succession of human authority or practice.

During the mid-17th century, the Bible became available to the common people. Those who were known as Separatists, separated from the Church of England, giving birth to such nonconformist movements as that of the Congregationalists and the Baptists.

Baptist historian William Brackney recognizes the beginning of Seventh Day Baptists by noting that "in the biblicism of the age when the Scriptures were being constantly re-examined as a standard of Free Church doctrine and practice, it is not surprising that a person or church should conclude that keeping the Sabbath was an inescapable requirement of biblical Christianity." (1)

One of the first Baptists to write in support of the seventh day Sabbath was James Ockford, whose book was condemned by Parliament. He was followed by others such as William Saller and Dr. Peter Chamberlen, men associated with the Mill Yard Church which still exists as a Seventh Day Baptist church in London.

Francis Bampfield, Edward and Joseph Stennett were leaders in the Pinners' Hall Church which existed as an SDB church until about 1850.

John James was another leader who has long been associated with the movement leading to the

Seventh Day Baptist cause in England. He was forcibly taken from his pulpit in Bull Stake Alley, arrested and martyred in 1661. Although the charge was largely political, he gave a strong testimony to the Sabbath and believers' baptism in his statement at the foot of the gallows.

James Ockford, Francis Bampfield, and John James are all mentioned in Part 9 of the series in *Plain Truth* (September 1991), but no mention is made of their Seventh Day Baptist connection, leading people to assume from the heading that they were members of the Church of God. (2)

Part 10 continues the history under the title, "The Sabbath Comes to New England." The authors credit Stephen Mumford with bringing the Sabbath to Rhode Island. They write of the separation of the Sabbathkeepers from the First Baptist Church of Newport in 1671.

Although the source of most of their material is taken from the *Seventh Day Baptist Memorial*, published in 1852-54, they avoid identifying that church as the first Seventh Day Baptist church in America. (3) Many of the existing records of that Newport Church are in the possession of the Seventh Day Baptist Historical Society, with the last book beginning with the words: "A continuation of the Records of the Seventh Day Baptist Church of Newport, RI." (4)

Part 11 of the series in *Plain Truth* magazine is entitled, "War and the New Frontier." Samuel Hubbard is erroneously listed as one of the founders of the Newport Baptist Church which was founded in 1644, whereas the records show he was baptized and joined in 1648. The authors identify Samuel's wife, Tacy, as "the first native-born American to convert to Sabbathkeeping," (5) yet she was born in 1609 in England, 11 years before the Pilgrims came to America. According to Samuel Hubbard's journal, the first native-born Americans to accept the Sabbath would have to have been the Hubbard's three daughters, Ruth, Rachel, and Bethiah.

"My wife took up the Lord's holy 7th day Sabbath the 10 day March 1665. I took it up 1 day April 1665. Our daughter Ruth-25 October 1665, Rachel-Jan. 15 day 1666, Bethiah-Feb. 1666. Our son Joseph Clarke-23 Feb. 1666." (6)

Ruth later married Robert Burdick. Rachel married Andrew Langworthy and was one of the charter members of the Newport Seventh Day Baptist church. Bethiah was the wife of Joseph Clarke. Many of today's seventh Day Baptists have documented direct lineage to these early Sabbathkeepers in Rhode Island.

Under a section headed, "The Name of the Church," the authors correctly recognize the Hopkinton congregation (the First Hopkinton Seventh Day Baptist Church in Ashaway, RI) as an outgrowth of the Newport Church, but refer to it as the "Church of God," based on a couple of passages which use the term "church of God" in a generic sense.

They correctly date the founding of the church at Piscataway, NJ, from the study of the Scriptures by Edmond Dunham in 1705. The authors call it "the Church of God," but a check of the record books clearly show that the early minutes all begin with the phrase, "The Church of Christ keeping the commandments of God and the faith of Jesus Christ ... " Several early Seventh Day Baptist churches did use the name Church of Christ, possibly to clearly identify the church as Christian rather than Jewish because of their Sabbath observance.

The authors make use of several Seventh Day Baptist books including the *Seventh Day Baptist*

Memorial, and Henry Clark's *A History of the Sabbatarians or Seventh Day Baptists in America*, published in 1811. However, several passages are quoted as being from Clark's book, when in reality they are from vol. 2 of *Seventh Day Baptists in Europe and America*. Again there is a marked avoidance of identifying the people and events as being Seventh Day Baptist.

The final quotes in that article from the November/December 1991 *Plain Truth* were taken from a more recent book, *A Free People in Search of a Free Land*, written in 1976 by the author of this review, and published by the SDB Historical Society. Yet no identification is made of its Seventh Day Baptist author or origin.

Seventh Day Baptists are anxious for the claims of the Sabbath to be proclaimed throughout the world. The Sabbath is not limited to anyone denomination. But in the interest of "the plain truth," falsehoods or misleading information do not advance the cause of truth in the world.

Footnotes

1. William Henry Brackney, *The Baptists* (West Port, CN: Greenwood Press, 1988), pp. 6-7.
2. Ronald D. Kelly, "Free at Last" in *The Plain Truth*, vol. 56:8 (September 1991), pp. 8-11.
3. Ronald D. Kelley and Jimmy Franks, "The Sabbath Comes to New England," in *The Plain Truth*, vol. 56:9 (October 1991), pp. 18-21.
4. *Records of the Seventh Day Baptist Church of Newport, RI* to June 5, 1892 (CRR 1922.1).
5. Ronald Kelly and Charles Vorhes, "War and the New Frontier," in *The Plain Truth*, vol. 56:10 (November/December 1991), pp. 18-21.
6. Samuel Hubbard's Journal circa 1633-1686. Manuscript relating to Samuel Hubbard of Newport, RI, transcribed from copies known by Isaac Backus, p. 10.

Appendix Two

“The Plain Truth Responds”

by Herman L. Hoeh

***The Sabbath Sentinel*, March 1992, page 10**

Your cover letter and the article by Don A. Sanford point up that certain editorial inaccuracies in the early history of Sabbatarians (in the U.S.) appeared in Part 11 of the series on the history of God's church in *The Plain Truth*. In particular, please thank Don Sanford for addressing them in *The Sabbath Recorder*.

As you know, God's people were commonly referred to as Sabbatarians in the 17th and 18th centuries and that is how we identified them—rather than by the now common denominational term Seventh Day Baptist. We did identify these first Sabbatarians in America as having reluctantly severed connection from the parent church, the First Baptist Church of Newport. As author Don A. Sanford says of the literature of God's people, the church of God was used as a generic term, not a denominational term. We used it thus throughout our series, and do not dispute the use of other terms in the Sabbatarian churches, for the New Testament does the same.

The introductory paragraphs of Part 11, page 18, column 1 of the series in *The Plain Truth* mentioning Samuel Hubbard and Tacy Hubbard are properly corrected by Don A. Sanford. The errors arose from misreading of the text and will be correct in any future reference to the Newport church.

The quotation in reference to the 18th century Sabbatarian church in Pennsylvania was wrongly attributed to Clarke's *History*, p. 1208, due to a deletion in copy fitting. The quotations should have been attributed to *Seventh Day Baptists in Europe and America*, volume 2, page 1208.

We happily thank Don Sanford for drawing readers' attention to these particular oversights in Part 11 of our series.

Appendix Three

Seventh Day Baptist Interactions with the Church of God

Over the decades a few Seventh Day Baptists have joined with the Church of God and a number have come to accept the holy days. I have personally met some of them and have had correspondence with others.

But there is nothing new to this as is demonstrated from the following quotes.

Richard Nickels in his *History of the Seventh Day Church of God* (chapter 5) reveals:

“In the first issue of the *Hope of Israel*, August 10, 1863, is a letter from Samuel Davison of Iowa. [Note: Samuel Davison was a Seventh Day Baptist pastor of the Marlboro (Salem), New Jersey Seventh Day Baptist church from 1844-46, and of Shiloh, New Jersey from 1846-49. He visited the Snow Hill German Seventh Day Baptist community in 1847. This may have been the same Samuel Davison, who appears as the Church of God leader in the 1860's.] ...

“E.S. Sheffield of Leicester, Wisconsin reported in Volume I, Number 13 (1864) [of the *Hope of Israel*] that some of his Wisconsin brethren were once members of the Seventh Day Baptist church at Albion, Wisconsin. Sheffield apparently preached among some Seventh Day Baptists, convincing them of conditionalism and life eternal only through Christ. The Seventh Day Baptist church expelled Sheffield's converts on the ground of heresy for denying the natural immortality of the soul. Elder Sheffield further reported that some of the elders connected with the Review denounced him and his Wisconsin followers because, though professing to keep the Sabbath, they did not develop moral characters. However, the White Party failed to define just what their immortality consisted of.”

History of the Church of God (Seventh Day) by John Kiesz:

“Seventh Day Baptists and Church of God Confer. At this conference [in 1923] were delegates from the Seventh Day Baptist denomination. Committees were appointed by both groups for the purpose of working out plans or ways whereby the Church of God and Seventh Day Baptists could cooperate and possibly eventually unite.” (p.82)

The proposed unification never eventuated.

Appendix Four

Chart of Several Possible Relationships to Church Eras

(extracted from *Seven Eras of Ancient Israel - Type of the Eras of the True Church?* by C White)

Comparison	Ephesus	Smyrna	Pergamos	Thyatira	Sardis	Philadelphia	Laodicea
with ancient Israel	Patriarchs (Abraham etc)	Israel in Egypt	Israel in the wilderness	Leadership of Joshua and the former Judges	the latter Judges and Saul	King David	Solomon and the divided kingdom
with parts of the temple	foundations	altar of sacrifice	roof	curtains and decorations	walls	pillars	outer court & Solomon's porch (court of the gentiles)
with 7 tribes which first settled the Holy Land	Benjamin	Simeon	Zebulun	Issachar	Asher	Naphtali	Dan
of false teachers and negative attributes in the eras	false apostles & Nicolaitanes	synagogue of Satan	doctrine of Balaam & Nicolaitanes	Jezebel & depths of Satan	"ready to die"	synagogue of Satan & "little strength"	"wretched, miserable, poor, blind, and naked"
of rewards of the eras	eat of the tree of life	not be hurt by the 2nd death	hidden manna and white stone with a new name	power over the nations	white raiment, in book of life and confess them to the Father before the angels	pillar in the Temple, God's name on their forehead and Christ's new name	sit with Christ on His throne
did each have a special message in addition to the Gospel?	Life, Death and Resurrection of Christ	Conditionalism, pagan origins of Easter etc.	Pagan origins of false days and idols	Identity of the Whore of Revelation	The Sabbath	Identity of Israel, Incredible Human Potential and Ezekiel's Message/the Captivity Doctrine	Preaches Christ. Will be a witness during the Tribulation

Associated Reading

This article should be read in conjunction with the following items to provide a more complete overview of the subject:

White, CM (2015)	<i>A Note on the Christian Israelite Church and the Sabbath.</i> Sydney, Australia.
White, CM (2015)	<i>The Independent Sabbatarian Groups c1800-1860.</i> Sydney, Australia.
White, CM (2016)	<i>Church of God Timelines.</i> Sydney, Australia.

References

Armstrong, H W (1963)	"... And now, Again – A New Good News", <i>Good News</i> , February, p. 8.
Armstrong, H W (1973)	<i>Autobiography of Herbert W Armstrong</i> , Vol 1. Worldwide Church of God, Pasadena, CA.
Armstrong, H W (1979)	"What God never did – Never will allow to happen," <i>Good News</i> , August 1979, pp. 1, 27.
Armstrong, H W (1980)	"The History and the Beginning and Growth of the WCG," <i>Good News</i> , June/July, p. 24.
Armstrong, H W (1980)	"The History and the Beginning and Growth of the WCG," <i>Good News</i> , September, p. 28.
Armstrong, H W (1980)	"The History and the Beginning and Growth of the WCG," <i>Good News</i> , August, pp. 4.
Armstrong, H W (1980)	"History of the Beginning and Growth of the Worldwide Church of God," <i>The Good News</i> , May, pp. 2, 22-24.
Armstrong, H W (1981)	"The Church they couldn't destroy," <i>Good News</i> , December, pp. 6-10.
Armstrong, H W (1985)	<i>Mystery of the Ages.</i> Worldwide Church of God, Pasadena, CA.
Ball, B (1981)	<i>he English connection: the Puritan roots of Seventh-Day Adventist belief.</i> Published by J. Clarke, Cambridge, England.
Ball, B (1994)	<i>The Seventh-day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800.</i> Published by Oxford University Press, Oxford and New York
Bodiroga, R (2006)	"Seventh Day Baptist Influence Upon Millerites," <i>Religion and Tolerance</i> , Issue 6, pp. 111-20.
Bond, A J (1922)	<i>Sabbath History 1. Before the Beginning of Modern Denominations.</i> American Sabbath Tract Society, Plainfield, NJ. Second Edition.
Bullinger, E W (c1920)	<i>The Companion Bible.</i>
Burdick, O (2014)	"Correcting Mistakes. Part 1," <i>The Sabbath Recorder</i> , April, p. 14.
Burdick, O (2014)	"Correcting Mistakes. Part 2," <i>The Sabbath Recorder</i> , May, p. 18.
Burdick, O (2014)	"Correcting Mistakes. Part 3," <i>The Sabbath Recorder</i> , June, p. 14.
Burt, M. D. (1995),	<i>Rachel Oakes & the Verona Seventh Day Baptist Church</i> (1 Oct). Seventh Day Baptist Historical Library & Archives, Janesville, WI.
Campbell, M W (2017)	"Developments in the Relationship between Seventh Day Baptists and Seventh-day Adventists, 1844-1884," <i>Andrew University Seminary Studies</i> , Vol. 55, No. 2, pp. 195-212.
Clarke, H (1811)	<i>A History of the Sabbatarians in America.</i> Seward & William, New York, NY
Dugger, A F (1899)	<i>Points of Difference between the Church of God and the Seventh-day Adventists Briefly Stated.</i> General Conference of the Church of God, Stanberry, MO.
Dugger, A N (1936)	<i>A History of the True Church.</i> The Bible Advocate, Salem, WV.

Dodd, C O	
Edwardson, C (1942)	<i>Facts of Faith</i> . Southern Publishing Association, USA.
Franks, J (1995)	"An Historical Perspective. "The Separation"," <i>New Beginnings</i> , 30 June, pp. 5-7
Haloviak, B (1994)	<i>Some Great Connections. Our Seventh-day Adventist Heritage from the Christian Church</i> . May. Adventist Archives, USA.
Haloviak, B (2016)	E-mail dated 23 March.
Hoeh, H L (1959)	<i>A True History of the True Church</i> . Radio Church of God, Pasadena, CA.
Hoeh, H L (1981)	"Can You Explain It?" <i>Good News</i> , August, pp. 19-22.
Hoeh, H L (1990)	"The Dramatic Story of Chinese Sabbath Keepers," <i>Good News</i> , Nov-Dec, pp. 15-18.
Hoeh, H L (1990)	<i>A Time For</i> (sermon, 27 January). USA.
Hoeh, H L (1992)	"The Plain Truth Responds," <i>The Sabbath Sentinel</i> , March, p. 10.
Katz, D S (1988)	<i>Sabbath and Sectarianism in Seventeenth-century England</i> . EJ Brill Publishers, Leiden, NY.
Kiesz, J (1965)	<i>History of the Church of God (Seventh Day)</i> . Midwest Bible College, Stanberry, MO.
Land, G (2005)	<i>Historical Dictionary of the Seventh-day Adventists</i> . The Scarecrow Press, Lanham, MD.
Lyell, L (1981)	<i>The Doctrines of the Seventh-day Men</i> . Honours thesis, La Trobe University, Melbourne.
Lyell, L (2008)	E-mail to Craig White. 3 June 2008.
Monroe, C (1969)	"A Synoptic History of the Churches of God in the Latter Days," <i>Facts of Our Faith</i> , January, pp. 12-25.
Neff, L (1959)	"What is the Laodicean Church?", <i>Good News</i> , August, pp. 9-10, 12.
Nickels, R C (1973)	<i>History of the Seventh Day Church of God</i> . Giving & Sharing, St. Charles, MO.
One Eternal Day website (2008)	"Seventh Day Baptist History III, A Denomination Takes Form 1790 – 1860". https://www.one-eternal-day.com/2008/02/seventh-day-baptist-history-iii.html (123 Feb).
Randolph, C F (1930)	<i>The Sabbath and Seventh Day Baptists</i> . American Sabbath Tract Society, Plainfield, NJ.
Randolph, C F (et al) (1907)	<i>Seventh Day Baptist Conference. It's Origin</i> . The American Sabbath Tract Society, Plainfield, NJ.
Rogers, A N (1910)	<i>Seventh Day Baptists in Europe and America</i> , Vol. 1. American Sabbath Tract Society for the Seventh Day Baptist General Conference, Plainfield, NJ.
Sabbath Sentinel staff (1992)	"SDBs Meet For 180 th General Conference, <i>The Sabbath Sentinel</i> , Oct, pp. 4-8.
Sanford, D A (1991)	<i>Conscience Taken Captive. A Short History of Seventh Day Baptists</i> . Seventh Day Baptist Historical Society, Janesville, WI.
Sanford, D A (1992)	"Research Reveals Plain Truth," <i>The Sabbath Sentinel</i> , March, pp. 8-10.
Sanford, D. A. (1903)	<i>A Free People in Search of a Free Land</i> . Seventh Day Baptist Historical Society, Janesville, WI.
Sanford, D. A. (2007)	<i>Greater Than Its Parts</i> . Seventh Day Baptist Historical Society, Janesville, WI.
Sanford, D. A. (2012)	<i>A Choosing People. The History of Seventh Day Baptists</i> . Mercer University Press, Macon, GA.
Seventh Day Baptists (1833)	<i>Expose of Sentiments</i> . USA.
Seventh Day Baptists (1844)	"The Second Advent and the Sabbath," <i>Sabbath Recorder</i> , Vol. 1, No. 1, 13 June, p. 2.
Seventh Day Baptists	"Communications," <i>The Sabbath Recorder</i> , 16 June, p. 2.

(1859)	
Seventh Day Baptists (1859)	"The Seventh-day Baptist Central Association," <i>The Sabbath Recorder</i> , 16 June, p. 2.
Steep, C (1983)	<i>Letter to Craig White</i> . (14 January)
Strand, K A (1982)	<i>The Sabbath in Scripture and History</i> . Review & Herald Publishing Association, Washington, DC.
Thomas, N G (1972)	"The Millerite Movement in Ohio," <i>Ohio History Journal</i> , Vol. 81, Spring, No. 2, pp. 95-107.
Thomsen, R J (1971)	<i>Seventh-Day Baptists: their legacy to Adventists</i> . Pacific Press Publishing Association, Nampa, ID.
Tillam, T (1657)	<i>The Seventh-day Sabbath Sought Out and Celebrated</i> . England.
Utter, G B (1844)	"The Second Advent and the Sabbath," <i>Sabbath Recorder</i> , Vol. 1, No. 1, 13 June, p. 2
White, C M (2006)	<i>Seven Restorations of the Work of the Church of God</i> . Sydney, Australia.
White, C M (2007)	<i>The Seven Eras of Ancient Israel - Type of the Eras of the Church?</i> Sydney, Australia.
White, C M (2008, 2015)	<i>A Note on the Christian Israelite Church and the Sabbath</i> . Sydney, Australia.
White, C M (2015)	<i>The Independent Sabbatarian Groups c1800-1860</i> . Sydney, Australia.
White, C M (2016)	<i>Church of God Timelines</i> . Sydney, Australia.
White, C M (2017)	<i>A Note on the Name of Christ and Preaching Christ</i> . Sydney, Australia.
Wilkinson, B G (1944)	<i>Truth Triumphant: The Church in the Wilderness</i> . Pacific Press, USA.



A Note on the Seventh-Day Baptist Relationship to the Church of God

By Craig M White

**History Research Projects
GPO Box 864, Sydney, Australia 2001
www.friendsofsabbath.org**

No limitation is placed upon reproduction of this document except that it must be reproduced in its entirety without modification or deletions. The publisher's name and address, copyright notice and this message must be included. It may be freely distributed but must be distributed without charge to the recipient.